



Philippine Amusement and Gaming Corporation

Creating Opportunities Beyond Gaming

PROCUREMENT DEPARTMENT

MEMORANDUM

February 28, 2022

FOR : THE CHIEF OF STAFF

FROM : THE ASSISTANT VICE PRESIDENT
Procurement Department

SUBJECT : BIDS AND AWARDS COMMITTEE (BAC) 2 RESOLUTION

May we forward, for your approval, the BAC 2 Resolution declaring the failure of Negotiated Procurement (Small Value Procurement) and recommending approval of the re-conduct of one (1) Appraiser for the Procurement of Services for Three (3) Appraisers to Determine the Market Value of Properties being Handled by PAGCOR under ITB No. SV21-07-021COR.

Thank you.

CHRISTINE ROSE J. FERNANDEZ

CDN/mbp02/28/2022

PROCUREMENT DEPARTMENT ROUTING SLIP	
AVP/SM <i>Melida/Bobby:</i> <i>pls proceed if</i> <i>in order</i> <i>ML 03/03</i>	
ACM	RBD
JSB	CDN
MJC	<i>Andrew</i> <i>02/28</i>

02 28/22
MELDA B. PEÑAREDONDO
PROCUREMENT OFFICER I

CTS. NO. 20 22030107533C
PD2022 00413



BIDS AND AWARDS COMMITTEE (BAC) 2

PROJECT DETAILS

Invitation to Bid Number	SV21-07-021COR
Title	Procurement of Services for Three (3) Appraisers to Determine the Market Value of Properties being Handled by PAGCOR
Mode of Procurement	Negotiated Procurement (Small Value)
End User	Corporate Disposal Committee (CDC)
Approved Budget for the Contract (ABC)	Two Hundred Seventy Thousand Pesos (PhP270,000.00) for Three (3) Appraisers or Ninety Thousand Pesos (PhP90,000.00) per Appraiser, VAT Exclusive, Zero-Rated Transaction
Date of APP Approval	December 9, 2020
BOD Approval	June 24, 2021
Budget Authorization Number	2110687

RESOLUTION DECLARING THE FAILURE OF SMALL VALUE PROCUREMENT AND RECOMMENDING APPROVAL BY THE CHIEF OF STAFF FOR THE RE-CONDUCT THEREOF

WHEREAS, the Bids and Awards Committee (BAC) 2 has been tasked to handle the procurement of the Philippine Amusement and Gaming Corporation (PAGCOR) with the project details presented above;

WHEREAS, the Procurement Department (PD), acting as the BAC Secretariat, received the Procurement Processing Request (PPR) and other pertinent documents related to the project on May 11, 2021;

WHEREAS, in the Pre-Procurement Conference held on May 19, 2021, the BAC 2, together with the representatives of the end-user, CDC, reviewed and evaluated all the documents presented including the Terms of Reference (TOR) integrated in the drafted Request for Quotation (RFQ);

WHEREAS, in the same meeting the BAC 2 noted that the Board approved budget allocated for the three (3) appraisers amounting to One Hundred Ninety-Seven Thousand Pesos (PhP197,000.00) was not sufficient and instructed the end-user to seek the approval of the Board for a supplemental budget for the project;

WHEREAS, on July 15, 2021, during the Second (2nd) Pre-Procurement Conference, the BAC Secretariat presented the approved supplemental budget dated June 24, 2021 to the BAC 2, and resolved to proceed with the finalization of the RFQ for the project since they found the rest of the documents in order;

WHEREAS, during the Deliberation Meeting held last August 4, 2021, the BAC Secretariat finalized the RFQ and presented to the BAC the schedule of the Submission, Receipt, Opening and Preliminary Examination of Quotations to be held on August 9, 2021;

WHEREAS, due to the implementation of the Enhanced Community Quarantine (ECQ) in the National Capital Region (NCR) on August 6, 2021, the RFQ was not finalized and the Secretariat requested for guidance to the BAC on whether to proceed with the posting of the RFQ;

WHEREAS, the BAC 2 resolved to defer the issuance and posting of the RFQ and proceed only upon lifting of the ECQ or other similar government restrictions in the National Capital Region (NCR);

WHEREAS, upon the instruction of the BAC, the RFQ was posted from September 9, 2021 to September 16, 2021 at the websites of PAGCOR and the Philippine Government Electronic Procurement System (PhilGEPS), and in a conspicuous place within the premises of PAGCOR Corporate Annex Office;

WHEREAS, copies of RFQ were sent through electronic mail to prospective bidders from the list of PAGCOR's Registry of Suppliers;

WHEREAS, on September 16, 2021, the deadline for the Submission and Receipt of Quotations, three (3) bidders submitted their quotations for the said project, namely:

1. Asian Appraisal Co., Inc.;
2. Topconsult, Inc.; and
3. Royal Asia Appraisal Corporation.

WHEREAS, on the same date, the Secretariat, the end-user, CDC, and the representative from the Security Group (SG), convened for the Opening and Preliminary Examination of the Sealed Quotations submitted by the above-mentioned bidders;

WHEREAS, after the Opening and Preliminary Examination of the submitted sealed quotations, the financial offers, as Read, of the qualified bidders were as follows:

Name of Bidder	Financial Offer, as Read
Asian Appraisal Co., Inc.	PhP80,000.00
Topconsult, Inc.	PhP85,000.00
Royal Asia Appraisal Corporation	PhP90,000.00

WHEREAS, based on the detailed bid evaluation conducted by the end-user for the abovementioned suppliers in a memorandum dated September 16, 2021, the CDC stated the following:

"xxx...xxx...xxx

Accurate mathematical computations.

xxx...xxx...xxx".

WHEREAS, in the Deliberation Meeting held on September 20, 2021, the BAC 2 discussed the results of the detailed bid evaluation conducted by the end-user, CDC, with details as follows:

Name of Bidder	Financial Offer, As Calculated VAT Exclusive, Zero-Rated Transaction	Rank	% Variance from ABC (PhP90,000.00)
Asian Appraisal Company, Inc.	Eighty Thousand Pesos (PhP80,000.00)	LCQ	11.11%
Topconsult, Inc.	Eighty-Five Thousand Pesos (PhP85,000.00)	Second (2 nd) LCQ	5.55%
Royal Asia Appraisal Corporation	Ninety Thousand Pesos (PhP90,000.00)	Third (3 rd) LCQ	0%

WHEREAS, all bidders complied with the requirements prescribed in the 2016 Revised Implementing Rules and Regulations (IRR) of Republic Act (R.A.) 9184;

WHEREAS, the BAC 2, through the PD, sent notifications to the three (3) bidders on September 21, 2021 with an advise to submit the post-qualification documents within five (5) calendar days from receipt of the notice;

WHEREAS, on October 28, 2021, the end-user, CDC submitted to the Secretariat their Evaluation Report for the technical and financial components dated October 18, 2021, and the results were as follows:

“xxx...xxx...xxx”

APPRAISER NAME	REMARKS
Asian Appraisal Company, Inc.	Compliant with Documentary Requirements.
Topconsult, Inc.	Non-Compliant with Documentary Requirements.
Royal Asia Appraisal Corporation	Compliant with Documentary Requirements.

xxx...xxx...xxx”

WHEREAS, in a Deliberation Meeting held on November 10, 2021, the PD presented to the BAC 2 the result of the evaluation of Technical components of Topconsult Inc. from the end-user dated October 18, 2021;

WHEREAS, in the same meeting, the BAC 2 declared the quotation submitted by Topconsult, Inc. as post-disqualified for non-compliance with the project's requirements as clearly stated in the RFQ, and instructed the Secretariat to issue a Notice of Post-Disqualification to the said bidder;

WHEREAS, on November 23, 2021, the PD sent the Notice of Post-disqualification to Topconsult Inc. thru email, and the latter acknowledged receipt on December 2, 2021;

WHEREAS, on December 9, 2021, during another Deliberation Meeting, the PD presented to the BAC 2 the acknowledged/signed Notice of Post-Disqualification and the signed Waiver to File a Request for Reconsideration from Topconsult Inc.;

WHEREAS, in the same meeting, the BAC 2 declared a Failure of Small Value Procurement, since the bidder failed to comply with all the requirements of the RFQ or failed the post-qualification, pursuant to Section 35.1(c) of the 2016 Revised Implementing Rules and Regulations (IRR) of the Republic Act (R.A.) 9184;

WHEREAS, the end-user, CDC, signified its intent for the re-conduct of procurement for one (1) appraiser;

WHEREAS, the BAC 1 instructed the end-user, CDC, to conduct a mandatory review on the terms and conditions and budget of the project to determine the reasons behind the failure of the procurement process prior to its re-conduct;

NOW, THEREFORE, We, the Members of the Bids and Awards Committee (BAC) 2, hereby **RESOLVE**, as it is hereby **RESOLVED**:

1. To declare a Failure of Negotiated Procurement (Small Value) of acquiring one (1) of the three (3) Lowest Calculated Quotations, since the bidder failed to comply with all the requirements of the project or failed the post-qualification, pursuant to Section 35.1(c) of the 2016 Revised Implementing Rules and Regulations (IRR) of the Republic Act (R.A.) 9184; and
2. To recommend for approval by the Chief of Staff (COS), as duly delegated by the Board of Directors as the Head of the Procuring Entity (HoPE) of PAGCOR, the Re-conduct of the Procurement of Services for one (1) Appraiser to Determine the Market Value of Properties being Handled by PAGCOR under ITB No. SV21-07-021COR, after the conduct of the mandatory review of the terms, conditions, technical specifications and cost estimates of the project, pursuant to Section 35.2 of the 2016 Revised IRR of R.A. 9184;

RESOLVED, at the Corporate Lounge, Sixth (6th) Floor, PAGCOR Executive Office, New Coast Hotel Manila, 1588 M.H. del Pilar Street corner Pedro Gil Street, Malate, Manila, this 9th day December 2021.

RODERICK R. CONSOLACION
Chairperson, BAC 2

GENE R. DOCTOR
Vice-Chairperson, ACD

JANICE A. GODORNES
Member, LG

ROBERT C. LUCQUIAO
Member, CMED

RYAN F. CORDETA
Member, TSD

NOT PRESENT
CARLOS C. CANLAS
Member, TD

APPROVED BY:

ALBERTO O. REGINO JR.
Chief of Staff

or
MS
pi

PP22-0805

22 MAR 02 02:15 PM

PROCUREMENT
DEPARTMENT



ATTENDANCE SHEET

Form No.	QMS - 644
Revision No.	0
Effectivity	March 15, 2019

Name of Meeting: **DELIBERATION MEETING (BAC 2)**
Procurement of Services for Three (3) Appraisers to Determine the Market Value of Properties being Handled by PAGCOR under ITB No. SV21-07-021COR

Date: December 9, 2021 Venue: Corporate Lounge, 6th Floor, PAGCOR Executive Office, 1588 M.H del Pilar corner Pedro Gil Street, Malate, Manila

Start Time: 5:00 PM End Time: 5:15 P.M.

NAME	ID NO.	POSITION	DEPT./OFFICE	SIGNATURE
1. RODERICK R. CONSOLACION, Chairperson	00-0199	Vice-President II	LG	
2. GENE R. DOCTOR, Vice-Chairperson	94-0099	Senior Manager	ACD	
3. JANICE A. GODORNES, Member	15-0039	Assistant Vice President I	LG	
4. ROBERT C. LUCQUIAO, Member	89-0708	Assistant Vice President I	CMED	
5. RYAN F. CORDETA, Member	01-0043	Senior Manager I	SSD	
6. CARLOS C. CANLAS, Member	87-0215	Sr. Treasury Officer	TD	NOT PRESENT
End-user/TWG				
7. Allan Marquez	00-0251		CDC/PD	
8. Jeffrey Silos			CDC/PD	NOT PRESENT
9.				
Secretariat/OPR				
10. Mary Ann Chavez	02-0721	Sr. Procurement Officer	PD	
11. Melda B. Penaredondo	016704	Procurement Officer 1	PD	
12. Ricky de Mesa	98-41407	Procurement Staff 2	PD	
Observer				